

Village of Kinderhook
Historic Preservation Commission
Regular Meeting - March 21, 2024
In-Person Meeting - Village Hall

Present: Ken Neilson-Vice-Chair, Randal Dawkins, Elizabeth Martin, Sean Sawyer,
Lisa Weilbacker-Alternate Member

Absent: Tim Husband-Chair, Quinn Murphy-Village Liaison

Others Present: Christine Berdahl, Larry Cavagnaro, Theo Fels, Julie Hamrah Fels, Douglas
Huntington, Carole Mott

K. Neilson brought the Regular Meeting to order at 6:59 pm.

Motion made for L. Weilbacker to be seated as the Alternate Member at tonight's
Regular Meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission, March 21, 2024.

Motion: E. Martin; Second: S. Sawyer. Motion carried.

Workshops: None

Minutes: Motion made to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes of November 16, 2023.
Moved: R. Dawkins; Second: E. Martin. Motion carried.

Motion made to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes of February 15, 2024.
Moved: S. Sawyer; Second: E. Martin. Motion carried.

Funds Remaining: \$730.05

Correspondence: None

Old Business: **CLG Grant Update** - E. Martin reported no action needed from HPC at this time for the grant, Village Clerk to advertise RFP this week which was approved by SHPO (State Historic Preservation Office) and Mayor.

5 Broad St/Fence/Ty McCormick

Fence variance application is now on the Zoning Board's Agenda for their next meeting scheduled for March 25, 2024. Once approved by the Zoning Board, the pending approved Certificate of Appropriateness by the HPC will be issued.

10 Albany Ave/Front Porch/Lorenza Pellicioli

Received Letter of Authorization for contractor Angelo Salvatore of Sal's Contracting for permission to come before the HPC to discuss application for front porch. However, Letter of Authorization appears to be from a management company as opposed from homeowner. J. Bujanow to confirm relationship of company to homeowner. Contractor came before the HPC at the February 15, 2024 meeting and Certificate of Appropriation was approved pending Letter of Authorization from the homeowner.

New Business: **11 Broad St/Windows & Exterior/Alexis & Samuel Plotner**

Christine Berdahl & Douglas Huntington - architects representing Alexis & Samuel Plotner, letter from homeowners received for their representation. Their clients are looking to improve the energy efficiency of their home, fossil fuel to electric. Christine & Douglas thanked the Commission for their feedback at last month's meeting.

Comment noted regarding application:

R. Dawkins questioned the house that was missing, 7 Broad St, on the panoramic picture provided on page 5 of 14 of the application, creating an incomplete streetscape. Architect C. Berdahl expressed that it was an oversight.

Following their "Description of Work" list which was provided to the Commission at last month's meeting, remaining open items on their list were addressed by the Commission at tonight's meeting:

- *The existing shutters are to be removed* - shutters on north facade to be removed and stored with the possibility of reinstallation at a later date if desired. Two sets of shutters, 1st and 2nd floor, on east side of building to remain closed and in place. HPC in agreement.
- *The existing windows at 1st, 2nd, & basement are to be replaced with wood double pane windows to match existing details. Exterior window trim is to remain and be repaired and painted as necessary* - Lepage brand windows, all wood, double hung, double pane, 6 over 6 with matched details, and simulated divided lights would replace existing. All double hung windows

will be replaced and the windows that are currently 4 over 4 which are 2 on the north-side, 1 on the east-side, and 1 on the west-side would be changed to 6 over 6.

- S. Sawyer was concerned about changing the existing 4 over 4 window on the west side to 6 over 6 which would change the external expression of the existing design.
 - Architect D. Huntington noted that they have been in contact with a salvage company who would be willing to take the windows for repurposing.
 - E. Martin had asked the architects at last month's meeting to look into interior/exterior storm windows and/or alternatives, rehabilitate rather than replace.
 - Architect D. Huntington expressed replacement would be an improvement for the exterior energy performance, an important piece to making the building more energy efficient.
 - Architect C. Berdahl discussed options with their client with consideration to maintenance, energy performance, installation/removal of exterior storm windows and screens on 2nd floor.
 - E. Martin noted it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards which the HPC is bound by for these decisions, there are alternatives to tightening up the windows, rehabilitating, and/or using different types of storms such as interior storms. E. Martin voiced her objection to window replacement.
 - K. Neilson suggested using interior storms.
 - R. Dawkins stated "the windows are the eyes of the house", most likely being original to the first period of the house, poured panes, and glass definition is one of the characteristics of the historic fabric of the structure. Interior storms would provide two elements of satisfying both needs which are efficiency and keeping the texture of the glass visible from the street. Replacing with the Lepage brand window with simulated divided lights would not be a true reproduction to be considered.
 - E. Martin noted the street elevation is the most critical elevation to communicate the age and history of the building and discussion was had regarding a single pane interior storm with a single bar, 1 over 1, to minimize the number of panes the viewer looks through.
 - S. Sawyer suggested the North elevation be a true restoration and possibly replacement windows on side elevations.
- No decision made at tonight's meeting, architects to reach back out to client regarding true window restorations to the North, East, & South facades and to also explore interior storm windows per consensus of the Commission.

- *One window at West Facade 2nd floor with adjacent shutters to be removed and replaced with a new window to match existing typical window sizes and details. Salvaged shutters to be reinstalled with salvaged/new to match existing scallop shingles adjacent - West elevation 2nd floor has one window 4 over 4 connected with shuttered window with scallop shingling between the two. Architects are proposing replicating the window in scale and size to match the existing windows, 6 over 6, allowing interior symmetry when moving interior walls. Proposed widening both windows 6"-8", center panel scallop shingled area would also be a little wider and centered under the gable.*
 - Discussion was had regarding the widening of the windows, the center panel between existing windows, the significance of the windows and center panel over time and if those changes were contributing, and if shuttering the window was an option. Although the windows are on the side of the building, they are visible from the public way.
- No decision made at tonight's meeting, architects to reach back out to client for further discussion/options.
- Architects were informed of the appeal process along with the document outlining the process.

Motion made to approve the removal and retention of the shutters on the North facade at 11 Broad St meeting criteria in Chapter 75-7B (1) and Chapter 75-C (1 & 4).

Motion: E. Martin; Second: L. Weilbacker. Motion carried.

29 Broad St/Conservatory & Deck/Richard & Carole Mott

Larry Cavagnaro, contractor, and Carole Mott, homeowner, presented their vision of a conservatory/addition to the back of the Mott's home at an HPC workshop, January 18, 2024 meeting.

Tonight, the application for a 15.5 ft x 25 ft addition to the back of the Mott's home where the current deck is now located was presented. The existing deck will be removed and reinstalled off the proposed addition of the conservatory. The new proposed conservatory will be built off the existing addition per drawings provided with application. Composite siding, Hardee Board, will be used and painted the same color as the house. Marvin windows, aluminum clad will be installed along with a standing seam metal roof. The new addition will be approximately 2 feet higher than the existing addition. Brick faced foundation will match the brick foundation on the house. Addition will be straight line and not stepped in as suggested at the workshop.

Motion made to approve the proposed addition at 29 Broad St and relocation of the existing deck meeting criteria in Chapter 75-7B (2, 3 & 4) and Chapter 75-C (1, 2, 3 & 4).

Motion: S. Sawyer; Second: R. Dawkins. Motion carried.

\$10 application fee will be dropped off to the Village Clerk.

3 Albany Ave/Exterior Renovations/Julie & Theo Fels

Julie & Theo appeared before the HPC for a workshop at the HPC's meeting on February 15, 2024.

Tonight they are presenting their application for the following exterior renovations:

- Skirting - remove skirting aka "canopy". Request removal of canopy that was added to the building possibly in the 1980's. HPC in agreement.
- Roof - reframe and replace the metal roof with asphalt shingles. Architectural shingles, charcoal color, were provided as a sample. The HPC suggested a flat shingle, 3 tab, as opposed to an architectural shingle. HPC in agreement with either asphalt shingles, the architectural shingle or the flat 3 tab shingle.
- Gutters - add gutters to the north and south edges of the roof to deter further degradation of the building's foundation, half round galvanized gutters to be used, drainage to back of property. HPC in agreement.
- Siding - replace current board and batten style siding with LP SmartSide vertical board & batten style siding, composite material. Color is expected to be a light gray.
- Windows - replacing 3 double hung windows, one in front, east side, on 1st floor right of entrance and two windows on north side on 1st floor. Upper windows to remain as is at this time. Lincoln windows, 2 over 2 aluminum clad to be used. HPC in agreement.
- Trim above front door - transom like detail to be added on top of board & batten siding with street number. Discussion if this trim detail will be part of the siding itself or on top of the board & batten. If it's an additional detail on top of the board & batten it was suggested not to show it on the rendering and add it as a sign at a later date. If its intended to be part of the trim, it should be recessed as part of the siding.
- Lighting - two sconces to be added right and left of front door. HPC suggested the sconces be dropped approximately 2 feet down from where they are placed in the photo. HPC in agreement to the style and lower placement of the fixture.
- Vent - add vent as an element to peak of roof. HPC suggested a ridge vent when installing the roof as opposed to a front vent. If installing a front vent a back vent would also need to be installed for air flow. Owners agreed to a roof ridge vent and not the front vent. HPC in agreement.
- Horizontal Board - HPC suggested the removal of the horizontal board, belt course, between the 1st and 2nd floor on the front of the building. Owners agreed.
- Window Lettering - owners will come back for approval of window lettering.
- Hanging Sign - owners will come back for sign approval.

K. Neilson requested owners to send front elevation with canopy, horizontal board, and vent removed and sconces at a lower level. Documents to be emailed to J. Bujanow for distribution to the Commission members.

Motion to approve pending the receipt of the new documents as discussed for the canopy removal, asphalt shingles with ridge vent, galvanized gutters, composite board & baton siding, 3 aluminum clad 2 over 2 window replacements, and front door surround including proposed sconces meeting criteria in Chapter 75-7B (2 & 4) and Chapter 75-C (1, 3 & 4).

Motion: R. Dawkins; Second: L. Weilbacker. Motion carried.

Received \$10 application fee.

28 Broad St/Roof/Robert Colannino & Mark Davis

Robert Colannino appeared before the HPC for a workshop at the HPC's meeting on February 15, 2024. They presented two types of shingles at the workshop with one style the HPC agreed upon.

Application received for tonight's meeting to replace old cedar shake shingles with IKO Performance Dynasty shingles in granite black color, the shingles that were agreed upon when viewing the samples at the workshop.

It was noted that cedar shakes have a very limited lifespan due to the quality of our present day wood.

Motion to approve the asphalt shingles at 28 Broad St meeting criteria in Chapter 75-B (2 & 4) and Chapter 75-C (1, 3 & 4).

Motion: L. Weilbacker; Second: S. Sawyer. Motion carried.

Procedures:

K. Neilson requested discussion on T. Husband's email regarding Chapter 75.

Discussion revolved around the language below in red:

"Ordinary Repair and Maintenance shall mean the act or process of preserving the features of a building, a structure or an object by consolidation or by replacement (in whole or part) in like kind, which does not change the form, material, or texture of the features, **unless reverting to an earlier historic condition documented by photograph or other unambiguous evidence.**"

Was the change contributing or not? Various projects were cited within the Village...preservation vs restoration, minimal intervention.

S. Sawyer also inquired regarding the two projects that did not come before the HPC, a new railing on 6 Broad St and repair work on 1 Broad St.

FINAL
3.21.24

Other:

Next meeting scheduled for April 18, 2024.

Motion to adjourn meeting at 8:38 pm.

Motion: S. Sawyer; Second: E. Martin. Motion carried.

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Jacqueline Bujanow". The signature is written in a cursive style with a horizontal line drawn through the middle of the letters.

Jacqueline Bujanow, Secretary
Historic Preservation Commission